

TENDER EVALUATION COMM ITTEE REPORT FOR SUPPLY AND DELIVERY OF MEAT, FISH AND POULTRY PRODUCTS TUK/T/01/2023-24

1. PREAMBLE

1.1 Background Information

Tender Title: Tender for Supply and Delivery of meat, fish and poultry products.

Tender Ref. No.: TUK/T/01/2023-24

1.2 Introduction

The Technical University of Kenya (TU-K) advertised for Supply and Delivery of meat, fish and poultry products on April 20^{th} , 2023. The closing /opening date of the tender was May, 3^{rd} 2023 but was extended to 10^{th} May 2023 at 10.00 am. The tender advertisement is attached and herein after referred to as *Appendix 1*.

1.3 Terms of Reference

The Tender Evaluation Committee (TEC) was to recommend the lowest evaluated bidder to the Director supply Chain Operations for consideration for the award of tender for Supply and Delivery of meat, fish and poultry products.

1.4 Scope: Supply and Delivery of meat, fish and poultry products.

2.0 EVALUATION CRITERIA

This was divided into four stages.

- i) Mandatory requirements evaluation criteria (must provide all the mandatory requirements)
- ii) Technical requirements evaluation criteria and visitation(site) evaluation
- iii) Financial evaluation criteria
- iv) Combined score evaluation

2.1 Tender Registration

The members noted and agreed that

- 1) Online submission of tender is allowed in the public procurement and asset disposal Act 2015 cap 64 section 2(b) and cap 77 section 1 and 4. Therefore, bidders are not bound to physically submit the tenders
- 2) Tender registration parameter should not be used to disqualify any bidder since it was not among the mandatory requirements in the evaluation criteria (as stipulated in the Act cap 79 section 2(a).

3) In future, bidders who submit their tender/bid documents within the stipulated time and deadlines will be the only ones considered to have participated in the tendering process.

3.0 First Stage

All the tenderers were subjected to an examination of seven (7) mandatory requirements. The mandatory information below MUST be provided. Any failure to provide ANY of the information under Mandatory requirements will lead to disqualification from further evaluation. All of them are listed in table 1.

Table1: Mandatory Evaluation Criteria

No.MANDATORY EVALUATION CRITERIA
1 Tender Security – Bank Guarantee or from an Insurance Company (All from acceptable and approved locally based Kenyan institutions)
2 Copy of Company or Firm's Registration Certificate
3 Copy of Valid Tax Compliance Certificate
4 Copy of Receipt for purchase of tender document (Free download)
5 Audited Financial Accounts for two years 2020/21 and 2021/22 duly
signed by your Auditing firm and Stamped
6 Attach current copy of Public Health Certificate
7 Ensure serialization of all pages of the bid submitted from the first page to the last pag in numerical form.

3.1 Second Stage

This involved detailed examination of the Technical Capacity of the tenderers.

Table 2: Technical Evaluation Criteria

S/	TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA		MARKS
NO			ALLOCATED
•			
1	Written confirmation on Terms Of Payment Of 30 Days	Credit	05
	Period on the Firms Letterhead		

2	Duly completed Form of Tender stamped and signed & Schedule of requirements duly filled indicating items offered and their prices. The bid submitted conforms to the required Specifications of the items andthe Unit of issue as provided in the tender document(Provide the unit of issue and specifications of the item you are quoting for)	20
3	Duly completed Declaration Form stamped and signed	05
4	Confidential Business Questionnaire (CBQ) duly filled stamped and Signed	15
5	Three Recommendation Letters bearing a name, contact person and Three Copies of LPOs or contracts from different Corporate organizations where you have supplied a similar product or service for the last 3 years	15
7	Evidence of Ownership of Delivery Vehicles	10
	Total	70

TOTAL TECHNICAL EVALUATION WILL BE OUT OF 70

NOTE: PASS MARK BEFORE PROCEEDING TO THE FINANCIAL EVALUATION = 60

3.2 FINANCIAL EVALUATION SHALL BE 30

This will include the following:-

- A) CONFIRMATION OF AND CONSIDERING PRICE
- B) CHECKING THAT THE TENDERER HAS QUOTED PRICES BASED ON VAT INCLUSIVE.
- c) CORRECTION OF ARITHMETICAL ERRORS,

After all the above have been confirmed,

- D) CONDUCTING A FINANCIAL COMPARISON.
- E) COMBINED SCORE

The Successful Tenderer shall be the lowest evaluated bidder.

NOTE

1. For purposes of evaluation, the exchange rate to be used for currency conversion shall be the selling exchange rate ruling on the date of tender closing provided by the Central Bank of Kenya. (Visit the Central Bank of Kenya website).

2.	Total tender value means the Tenderer's total tender price inclusive of Value Added Tax
	(V.A.T) for the goods it offers to supply.

4.0 Bids Received

Four (4) bidders submitted their bids as outlined in table 3.1

Table 3.1: Bids Received as at Bid Opening

	200010 0121 2100 211	eccived as at Dia opening		
B/No	Company Name	Tender Sum Amount (ksh)	Tender Security(KES)	Financing Company
B1	Jojen Butchery	77,207,700.00	772,000.00	Co-operative bank
B2	Quality Meat Packers Limited	70,439,880.00	704,398.80	Standard Charter Bank
В3	Silverside	53,939,530.00	N/A	N/A
B4	Corporate Transfer Solutions Limited	76,756,232.00	767,562.32	Metropolitan canon

4.1 Compliance with Mandatory Requirements

Table 3.2 outlines compliance with the mandatory requirements from bids received.

Table 3.2: Compliance with Mandatory Requirements

BIDDERS	Yes/No √/×	B1	B2	В3	B4

1	Tender Security – Bank Guarantee or from an Insurance	√/×	✓	✓	X	✓
	Company (All from acceptable and approved locally					
	based Kenyan institutions)					
2	Copy of Company or Firm's Registration Certificate	√/×	✓	✓	✓	✓
3	Copy of Valid Tax Compliance Certificate	√ / ×	✓	✓	✓	✓
4	Copy of Receipt for purchase of tender document (Free	√ / ×	✓	✓	✓	✓
	download)					
5	Audited Financial Accounts for two the years 2020/21 and 2021/22 duly	√ / ×	X	✓	X	✓
	signed by your Auditing firm and Stamped					
6	Attach current copy of Public Health Certificate	√ / ×	✓	✓	√	√
7	Ensure serialization of all pages of the bid submitted	√ / ×	✓	✓	✓	✓
	from the first pageto the last page in numerical form.					

Two bidders B1 and B3 did not proceed to the next stage of evaluation because in B1's Financial accounts the auditor has not claimed the ownership by stamping and signing on each page. B3 did not attach a Tender security / Bid bond.

Bidder B2 and B4 proceeded to the next evaluation stage.

5.0 Technical Evaluation

The bidders were subjected to detailed technical examination as outlined in tabled 3.3

Table 3.3: Detailed Technical Evaluation.

S/NO.	TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA	MKS	B2	B4
1	Written confirmation on Terms Of Payment Of 30 Days Credit Period on the Firms Letterhead	05	5	5
2	Duly completed Form of Tender stamped and signed & Schedule ofrequirements duly filled indicating items offered and their prices. The bid submitted conforms to the required Specifications of the items andthe Unit of issue as provided in the tender document (Provide the unit of issue and specifications of the item you are quoting for)	20	20	20

3	Duly completed Declaration Form stamped and signed	05	5	5
4	Confidential Business Questionnaire (CBQ) duly filled stamped and Signed	15	15	15
5	Three Recommendation Letters bearing a name, contact person and Three Copies of LPOs or contracts from different Corporate organizations where you have supplied a similar product or service for the last 3 years	15	15	15
6	Evidence of Ownership of Delivery Vehicles	10	10	5
	Total	70	70	65

Based on the technical evaluation results, the following information was established:

B2 scored 70 and B4 scored 65. B4 lost 5 points because they only showed evidence of ownership of one car.

The pass mark before proceeding to the financial evaluation is 60 out of 70. From Table 3.3 bidders B2 and B4 met the pass mark of 60 and therefore proceeded to the next stage of financial evaluation.

5.1 Financial Evaluation

The two bidders, B2 and B4 were evaluated financially as detailed in table 3.4.

Table 3.4: Financial Evaluation

				B2		B4	
S/N o	Meat, Fish and Products	Unit	Qty	Unit Price Vat Incl. (Kshs)	Total Price Vat Incl. (Kshs)	Unit Price Vat Incl. (Kshs)	Total Price Vat Incl. (Kshs)
1	BACON	PKT	496	1200	595200	1720	853120
2	BEEF BONES	KG	1320	100	132000	200	264000
3	BEEF SAUSAGES (400G)	PKT	1260	200	252000	390	491400
4	BONES		960	100	96000	200	192000

5	COOKED HAM	PKT	300	940	282000	1531	459300
6	FISH FILLET (N/PERCH)	KG	3534	970	3427980	1200	4240800
7	GARLIC SALAMI	PKT	250	0	0	1375	343750
8	GOAT RIBS	KG	1200	500	600000	700	840000
9	KIDNEYS	KG	200	500	100000	650	130000
10	LAMB CHOPS	KG	1194	860	1026840	900	1074600
11	LAMB RIBS	KG	944	500	472000	700	660800
12	LAMB SHOULDER	KG	500	650	325000	750	375000
13	LAMBKIDNEY	KG	300	385	115500	700	210000
14	LEG OF LAMB	KG	2800	750	2100000	750	2100000
15	MATUMBO/TR IPE	KG	4470	320	1430400	300	1341000
16	MINCED MEAT	KG	1684	540	909360	650	1094600
17	MUTTON CHOPS	KG	2910	650	1891500	900	2619000
18	MUTTON CUT	KG	500	650	325000	900	450000
19	OX-LIVER	KG	7638	500	3819000	650	4964700
20	PORK CHOPS	KG	576	0	0	1187	683712
21	RUMPSTEAK	KG	2500	850	2125000	750	1875000
22	SILVERSIDE	KG	1000	780	780000	750	750000
23	STEWING STEAK	KG	1000	620	620000	750	750000
24	STRIPLOIN	KG	500	1010	505000	850	425000
25	SUASAGE MEAT	KG	800	450	360000	800	640000

26	T. BONE STEAK	KG	10245	1180	12089100	950	9732750
27	T-BONE	KG	600	1180	708000	900	540000
28	TILAPIA FILLETS	KG	2190	1050	2299500	1100	2409000
29	TOP SIDE	KG	28930	820	23722600	750	21697500
30	VEAL	KG	300	0	0	550	165000
31	BEEF FILLET	KG	600	1280	768000	900	540000
32	WHOLE TILAPIA	KG	3400	520	1768000	500	1700000
33	RED SNAPPER	KG	70	1050	73500	800	56000
34	BARACUDA	KG	50	0	0	850	42500
35	SHELFISH	KG	80	0	0	1400	112000
36	KINGFISH SLICED	KG	100	0	0	1500	150000
37	QUEEN PRAWN	KG	50	0	0	3900	195000
38	TIGER PRAWNS	KG	60	0	0	3900	234000
39	JUMBO PRAWNS	KG	80	0	0	3900	312000
40	GIANT PRAWNS	KG	80	0	0	3900	312000
41	TUNA FILLETS	KG	40	0	0	1800	72000
42	TROUT FILLETS	KG	60	0	0	2200	132000
43	SALMOND FILLET	KG	80	0	0	6000	480000
44	LAMB CUTLETS	KG	500	700	350000	900	450000
45	LAMB SADDLES	KG	160	800	128000	750	120000
46	LAMB LONG CHOPS	KG	150	900	135000	900	135000
47	BEFF MEAT ON BONE	kg	1,500	520	780000	500	750000
48	CHICKEN CAPONS	KG	6510	440	2864400	480	3124800

49	CHICKEN WINGS	KG	800	770	616000	700	560000
50	DRUM STICK	KG	800	600	480000	700	560000
51	CHICKEN LEGS	KG	800	635	508000	550	440000
52	UNFERTILIZE D EGGS	TRAYS	120	0	0	650	78000
53	SPRING CHICKEN	KG	1440	450	648000	850	1224000
54	EGGS	TRAYS	4895	0	0	480	2349600
55	GIZZARDS	KG	400	530	212000	550	220000
	GRAND TOTAL COST				70439880		76720932

5.2 Bidder B2 and B4 qualified for due diligence for Supply and Delivery of meat, fish and poultry products.

Due Diligence

The committee visited B2 and B4. The evaluation criteria is as below.

No.	MANDATORY EVALUATION CRITERIA
1	Company or Firm's Registration Certificate
2	Valid Tax Compliance Certificate
3	Current copy of Public Health Certificate
4	Current copy of Food Handling Certificate
5 meat.	Evidence of Ownership of more than Two Delivery Vehicles with modifications to transport
6	Samples available
7	Remarks:

No.	DUE DILLIGENCE EVALUATION CRITERIA	Yes/No	
		B2	B4
1	Company or Firm's Registration Certificate	✓	X
2	Valid Tax Compliance Certificate	✓	✓
3	Current copy of Public Health Certificate	✓	X
4	Current copy of Food Handling Certificate	✓	X
5	Evidence of Ownership of more than Two Delivery Vehicles with modifications to transport meat.	✓	X
6	Samples available	√	X

There was no original documents presented, no evidence of ownership or lease of meat delivery vehicles by B4.B2 presented all the relevant documents.

6.0 Tender Evaluation Committee's Recommendation

From Table 3.5 the prices were compared on common range of items quoted by both firms. It was observed that B2 was the lowest and most responsive bidder.

The Tender Evaluation Committee recommends award to bidder B2, M/S Quality Meat Packers Limited at a total cost of Kshs. 70,439,880.00 (Seventy Million, Four Hundred and Thirty-Nine Thousand, Eight Hundred and Eighty Shillings Only) for the supply and delivery meat, fish and poultry products of as contained in Table 3.8.

TABLE 3.8 QUALITY MEAT PACKERS LIMITED ITEMS AWARDED 2023/2024

The Tender Evaluation Committee recommended award of common bidded items to B4 who quoted for them as contained in table 3.9

				B2	
S/No	Meat, Fish and Products	Unit	Qty	Unit Price Vat Incl. (Kshs)	

1	BACON	PKT	496	1200	595200
2	BEEF BONES	KG	1320	100	132000
3	BEEF SAUSAGES (400G)	PKT	1260	200	252000
4	BONES		960	100	96000
5	COOKED HAM	PKT	300	940	282000
6	FISH FILLET (N/PERCH)	KG	3534	970	3427980
8	GOAT RIBS	KG	1200	500	600000
9	KIDNEYS	KG	200	500	100000
10	LAMB CHOPS	KG	1194	860	1026840
11	LAMB RIBS	KG	944	500	472000
12	LAMB SHOULDER	KG	500	650	325000
13	LAMBKIDNEY	KG	300	385	115500
14	LEG OF LAMB	KG	2800	750	2100000
15	MATUMBO/TRIPE	KG	4470	320	1430400
16	MINCED MEAT	KG	1684	540	909360
17	MUTTON CHOPS	KG	2910	650	1891500
18	MUTTON CUT	KG	500	650	325000
19	OX-LIVER	KG	7638	500	3819000
21	RUMPSTEAK	KG	2500	850	2125000
22	SILVERSIDE	KG	1000	780	780000
23	STEWING STEAK	KG	1000	620	620000
24	STRIPLOIN	KG	500	1010	505000
25	SUASAGE MEAT	KG	800	450	360000
26	T. BONE STEAK	KG	10245	1180	12089100
27	T-BONE	KG	600	1180	708000
28	TILAPIA FILLETS	KG	2190	1050	2299500
29	TOP SIDE	KG	28930	820	23722600
31	BEEF FILLET	KG	600	1280	768000
32	WHOLE TILAPIA	KG	3400	520	1768000
33	RED SNAPPER	KG	70	1050	73500
44	LAMB CUTLETS	KG	500	700	350000
45	LAMB SADDLES	KG	160	800	128000
46	LAMB LONG CHOPS	KG	150	900	135000
47	BEFF MEAT ON BONE	kg	1,500	520	780000
48	CHICKEN CAPONS	KG	6510	440	2864400
49	CHICKEN WINGS	KG	800	770	616000
50	DRUM STICK	KG	800	600	480000
51	CHICKEN LEGS	KG	800	635	508000
J1	CHICKEN LEGS	1ZG	000	933	200000

53	SPRING CHICKEN	KG	1440	450	648000
55	GIZZARDS	KG	400	530	212000
	GRAND TOTAL COST				70,439,880

EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

1.	Prof. Jackton Odote	Date
2.	Mr. Kelvin Mwanza	Date
3.	Mr. Jackson Moenga	Date
4.	Ms. Anita Godosyo	Date
5.	Mr. Paul Mwangi	Date
6.	Mr. Hawkins Jumba	Date